

NAME:

DATE:

IS THIS A DILEMMA?

As we engage in the world we often encounter "dilemmas."

This exercise explores what makes a situation a dilemma.

1. Pick one of the three characters below, and read their scenario.
2. Complete the statement on the following page: "I think #1 is OR isn't a dilemma because..."
3. Read the #2 version of the dilemma, considering the new information that has been added. Answer the open-ended prompt again.
4. Read the #3 version of the dilemma, considering the final set of new information. Answer the final open-ended prompt.

Li Wei #1

Li Wei is a reporter for his school newspaper. He recently submitted an article for the paper in which he argued that governments should not limit or stop the production of genetically modified foods (GMOs). However, the editor says that Li Wei can't write articles about this topic. The editor says he will not be able to publish Li Wei's article.

Matthias #1

Matthias is eager to buy the best new XYZ smartphone that's just been released. He wants to be a music producer, and he knows the phone has great recording features. Matthias does not have access to a computer at home, and this phone is most likely his best chance to make great music over the next year.

Farah #1

Farah is a high school student. Farah is Muslim, and it's important to her and her family that she wears a hijab (a head scarf worn by some Muslim women) at all times in public. The head of her school has just passed a rule banning religious clothing on campus. Most of Farah's teachers are fairly tolerant and continue to allow her to wear her hijab.

Li Wei #2

Li Wei is a reporter for his school newspaper. He recently submitted an article for the paper in which he argued that governments should not limit or stop the production of genetically modified foods (GMOs). However, the editor says that Li Wei can't write articles about this topic. The editor says he will not be able to publish Li Wei's article.

Li Wei argues in his article that GMOs support farming industries and help reduce hunger in many developing nations. The editor's argument is that a school newspaper is not allowed to make political statements. Li Wei lives in a country where freedom of the press is protected by the government. However, the editor argues that the school newspaper is not a "real" newspaper and that reporters have to do what the editor says.

Matthias #2

Matthias is eager to buy the best new XYZ smartphone that's just been released. He wants to be a music producer, and he knows the phone has great recording features. Matthias does not have access to a computer at home, and this phone is most likely his best chance to make great music over the next year.

However, a newspaper article has just been published explaining how XYZ company uses teen labor in order to make the phone. The teenage workers, usually between 15 and 17 years of age, work at the company's factories for five months in order to get work experience to be able to graduate from their local school.

Farah #2

Farah is a high school student. Farah is Muslim, and it's important to her and her family that she wears a hijab (a head scarf worn by some Muslim women) at all times in public. The head of her school has just passed a rule banning religious clothing on campus. Most of Farah's teachers are fairly tolerant and continue to allow her to wear her hijab.

However, the school's sports trainer reminds Farah of the new rule and refuses to allow her to participate in any athletic activities unless she removes it. Farah has always been an active volleyball player and wants to join the school team. She even thinks she might be able to be a professional player someday. She knows the sports trainer won't let her on the team unless she removes her hijab.

Li Wei #3

Li Wei is a reporter for his school newspaper. He recently submitted an article for the paper in which he argued that governments should not limit or stop the production of genetically modified foods (GMOs). However, the editor says that Li Wei can't write articles about this topic. The editor says he will not be able to publish Li Wei's article.

Li Wei argues in his article that GMOs support farming industries and help reduce hunger in many developing nations. The editor's argument is that a school newspaper is not allowed to make political statements. Li Wei lives in a country where freedom of the press is protected by the government. However, the editor argues that the school newspaper is not a "real" newspaper and that reporters have to do what the editor says.

Li Wei wants to be a journalist in the future and is not sure if he should agree to follow the editor's rules. He has access to the school's newspaper database and *could* send out his article himself. Li Wei also knows that the editor has sent around an article to the newspaper staff in the past that says that GMOs cause cancer and other health problems.

Matthias #3

Matthias is eager to buy the best new XYZ smartphone that's just been released. He wants to be a music producer, and he knows the phone has great recording features. Matthias does not have access to a computer at home, and this phone is most likely his best chance to make great music over the next year.

However, a newspaper article has just been published explaining how XYZ company uses teen labor in order to make the phone. The teenage workers, usually between 15 and 17 years of age, work at the company's factories for five months in order to get work experience to be able to graduate from their local school.

The students are required to work long hours, sometimes over 11 hours a day. XYZ company insists that the students are choosing to work at the factories and are being paid fairly. The teens say they are being forced to work at the phone factories and that the work has nothing to do with their education. Having read this article, now Matthias isn't sure if he should buy the phone.

Farah #3

Farah is a high school student. Farah is Muslim, and it's important to her and her family that she wears a hijab (a head scarf worn by some Muslim women) at all times in public. The head of her school has just passed a rule banning religious clothing on campus. Most of Farah's teachers are fairly tolerant and continue to allow her to wear her hijab.

However, the school's sports trainer reminds Farah of the new rule and refuses to allow her to participate in any athletic activities unless she removes it. Farah has always been an active volleyball player and wants to join the school team. She even thinks she might be able to be a professional player someday. She knows the sports trainer won't let her on the team unless she removes her hijab.

Farah is not sure whether it will go against her beliefs if she only takes her hijab off during volleyball practice—it's only a few hours a week—and she knows she needs to be on the team this year if she wants to have a chance at a volleyball career. However, she also does not want to disappoint her family, religious community, and her own personal standards by complying with the rule.

